

however, and it is safe to predict more and better things from Dr Macinnes in future.

MAURICE LEE, JR
Rutgers University

John Morrill (ed.), *The Scottish National Covenant in its British Context 1638-51*.

Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, 1990. Pp. vi + 218. £30.00.

Five of this book's eight chapters were products of a conference in Edinburgh marking the 350th anniversary of the Covenant. As only three of the authors are based in Scotland and four of them based in North America, that Scottish event clearly has a significance furth of Scotland—though a lot of the detail has not been mastered by those who write about it. The editor, in his own contribution, alludes to problems inevitable in dynastic unions and stresses the need to examine a *British* (or perhaps even a European?) rather than an *English* context, but his emphases were not always kept in sight by his collaborators. There is little cohesion or even agreement among the authors: notably Morrill generalises about the transformation of the Scottish nobility into a British aristocracy with “English wives, English-educated sons and estates and offices on both sides of the Border”, but Keith Brown's careful chapter on “Courtiers and Cavaliers” comes near to proving this a figment of the imagination. Morrill will have it that the Covenant was “a document of the Scottish nation”, but Brown analyses the opposition which existed from the outset. Morrill sees royal ecclesiastical aims as mere “congruity” between the churches, but Margaret Steele adheres to “uniformity”. Morrill denies that the Covenant was “specifically anti-episcopal”, but Allan Macinnes and Peter Donald show how it had to be interpreted in a presbyterian sense and Steele thrice dubs it “presbyterian” without qualification. Sometimes there is self-contradiction even within an article: Macinnes begins by dismissing the concept of moderates and extremists within the covenanting movement as a product or even fabrication of the Restoration era, but as his chapter proceeds his argument hinges on precisely that division. The most important contributions are Steele's examination of federal theology (with new MS material); Edward Cowan's characteristically spirited and witty investigation of the roots—as well as the “making”—of the Covenant, with reference to Althusius; Peter Donald on Anglo-Scottish contacts in the era before the Covenants—a topic which might have been carried much farther; Edward Furgol on the Army of the Covenant; and Keith Brown on “Courtiers and Cavaliers”.

If disagreement is a defect, there is a related merit, for the volume could provide excellent ammunition for discussion groups.

GORDON DONALDSON

Elaine McFarland, *Protestants First: Orangeism in Nineteenth Century Scotland*.

Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, 1990. Pp. 255. £30.00.

This book began as a thesis and refers to various social science theories which the author, understandably, finds not very helpful. Her story is of a movement which “was something of an anachronism even at its moment of birth”, but which had influence in Ulster where it enjoyed “protection from legal proceedings”. In Scotland it could not live without “regular marches and confrontations, yet the reputation thus gained by the Institution for provoking violence and disorder led it into disrepute and crucially alienated middle and upper class support”. It could never flourish as it was seen to be an Irish import, “and a violent and drunken one”. Yet attempts to make it respectable ran counter to its main purpose, which was domination; “Where you could walk you were dominant, and the other things followed”. It did have a loose link with Tory interests, but although the Tory party in the West of Scotland was weak, it was never weak enough to need the Orange vote which could never go anywhere else anyway.

At the end, the author concludes that Orangeism owes its existence to its “continual grounding in the daily conditions of life of its predominantly working class membership”. But which daily conditions? Orangeism only holds the loyalty of a minute fraction of the working class, and its outlook is perhaps more nostalgic than this book would suggest. The real problem is not why Orangeism was always weak, which is the theme of this book, but why it was not even weaker.

GAVIN WHITE

University of Glasgow

Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds.), *Sermons and Battle Hymns: Protestant Popular Culture in Modern Scotland*.

Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, 1990. Pp. 261. £30.00.

The rôle of Protestantism in Scotland during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries remains remarkably little explored. The explanation of the neglect does not lie in the weakness of the

Protestant churches during the period. On the contrary, as this volume illustrates, the social influence of the various denominations has been enormous. Now Tom Gallagher of the University of Bradford and Graham Walker of Sussex have brought together a dozen essays to help fill the gap in the secondary literature.

Several contributions are concerned with images. Christopher Harvie writes about the tradition of the Covenanters, suggesting that their memory could be put to either conservative or radical use. John Mackenzie points out that the chief twentieth-century modification of the powerful imperial myth surrounding David Livingstone was to turn him into a distinctively Scottish hero. The Freemasons, Gerry Finn stresses, became so identified with the establishment that they were branded with the charge of discriminating against Roman Catholics. Other essays look at the place in society of the churches themselves. Allan Macinnes surveys the Evangelicalism of the Highlands during the nineteenth century. Building on a wide range of statistics, he shows that, although the Free Church had a fairly low membership, before the end of the nineteenth century it held the allegiance of a majority of the population above the age of thirteen in three out of four of its Highland synods. Callum Brown, in the most challenging of all the pieces, argues that there was no gulf between the working classes and the churches in the nineteenth or early twentieth centuries. Only since the 1960s have the two drifted apart.

There are three essays on political themes. Graham Walker relates Protestant/Catholic rivalries to party loyalties. The other editor, Tom Gallagher, traces the recent rise of the salience of the Church of Scotland in public life. And Steve Bruce demonstrates that only a tiny number of working-class Protestants have shown active sympathy for their militant co-religionists in Ulster during the Troubles. In other items Walker repudiates with gusto the charge that Rangers football supporters have been right-wing bigots; Ian Wood contends that the British state has been far more important than popular Protestantism in moulding Scottish regimental traditions in the army; and Kay Carmichael complains (though with many sweeping generalisations and some plain errors) that women have been humiliated by Protestantism. The remaining contribution, again by Gallagher, studies the fiery opposition of the *Scottish Daily Express* to the Presbyterian-Anglican union discussions of 1957-67. The chief instigator, it turns out, was that lapsed son of the manse, Lord Beaverbrook.

Not all the writing in this volume is crisp or cogent, and there are other regrettable flaws: Fundamentalism, for example, is unjustifiably attributed to Evangelicals in three separate pieces. Yet important questions are raised about Scottish Protestantism. Further

books are needed to provide more of the answers. Meanwhile the explorations in this volume are to be warmly welcomed.

D. W. BEBBINGTON
University of Stirling

